

Development Management Officer Report Committee Application

Summary	
Committee Meeting Date: 20 th June 2017	
Application ID: LA04/2016/2456/F	
Proposal: Temporary teaching accommodation (3 prefabricated buildings providing 6 classrooms), temporary kitchen and dining hall building, security fencing and car parking with associated site works including demolition of existing school meals building, to facilitate temporary school decant from Avoniel Road school site	Location: Elmgrove Primary School (Beersbridge Road Site) Beersbridge Road Belfast
Referral Route: Associated with Major Application (LA04/2016/2219/F)	
Recommendation:	Temporary Approval – 3 years
Applicant Name and Address: Education Authority Belfast Region 40 Academy Street Belfast BT1 2NQ	Agent Name and Address: Todd Architects 2nd Floor Titanic House 6 Queens Road Belfast
<p>Executive Summary:</p> <p>Full planning permission is sought for the erection of temporary teaching accommodation (3 prefabricated buildings providing 6 classrooms), a temporary kitchen and dining hall building, security fencing and car parking with associated site works including demolition of existing school meals building.</p> <p>The development is to facilitate the complete decant of Elmgrove Primary School, Avoniel Road site to allow the proposed refurbishment and extension to the school (LA04/2016/2219/F).</p> <p>This temporary accommodation is required for a period of 3 years.</p> <p>Historic Environment Division is content with the proposal subject to removal of the temporary structures. A time limit condition will ensure the adverse impact upon the historic and architectural character of the listed school buildings, their curtilage and setting shall be of the minimum practicable duration.</p> <p>Having had regard to the development plan, relevant planning policies and other material considerations it is concluded that the proposal complies with the development plan, regional planning policy and other material considerations.</p> <p>Recommendation Approval for a temporary period with conditions.</p>	

Site Location Plan



Characteristics of the Site and Area

1.0	Description of Proposed Development
1.1	Full planning permission is sought for the erection of teaching accommodation – 3No temporary pre-fabricated teaching pods providing 6No classrooms. A temporary school meals kitchen and dining hall building, security fencing and car parking with associated site works including demolition of existing school meals building.
1.2	This application is associated with Listed Building Consent LA04/2016/2452/LBC.
2.0	Description of Site.
2.1	The site is located with Elmgrove Primary School complex located in east Belfast which is a Grade A listed building. Elmgrove Primary School is an accomplished example of one of

2.2	<p>prominent architect R S Wilshere's schools in Arts & Crafts style. Two-storey redbrick school complex dating from 1933, it consists of two main blocks arranged around quadrangles and linked by a gabled assembly hall.</p> <p>The site is bounded by steel fencing and brick walls enclosing the school buildings, playground and small grassed areas. Part of the site falls outside the school enclosure within an area of the neighbouring industrial complex, this is an area of hard standing enclosed by steel fencing.</p>
Planning Assessment of Policy and other Material Considerations	
3.0	Planning History
3.1	LA04/2016/2452/LBC – Temporary teaching accommodation, temporary school meals kitchen and dining hall, security fencing and parking along with associated site works including demolition of existing school meals building. Accommodation comprises of 3No. temporary pre-fabricated teaching pods providing 6No. classrooms.
4.0	Policy Framework
4.1	<p>Belfast Urban Area Plan 2001 Draft Belfast Metropolitan Area Plan 2015 – Designation BT 087 Avoniel Local Landscape Policy Area, BT 147 07 Community Greenway and BT 005 04 Existing Employment Castlereagh Road. SPPS: Planning for Sustainable Development PPS 4: Planning and Economic Development PPS 6: Planning Archaeology and the Built Heritage</p>
5.0	Statutory Consultee Responses
	<p>Transport NI – Further Information Requested Northern Ireland Water – No objection subject to informatives</p>
	Non Statutory Consultees Responses
	<p>BCC Environmental Health (EHS) – Further Information Requested Historic Environment Division – No objection subject to time limit condition</p>
7.0	Representations
7.1	The application has been advertised in the local press and neighbour notifications issued. No representations received to date.
8.0	Other Material Considerations
	None
9.0	Assessment
9.1	<p>The main issues to be considered in this case are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Impact on the setting of the listed building; - Loss of Open Space; - Impact on Character and Amenity; - Traffic and parking; - Other Environmental Matters.
9.2	The proposal includes the demolition of the existing school meals building located in the eastern portion of the site to provide a new hard play area (960 square metres). A temporary school meals kitchen and dining hall building will be erected in the north western corner of the site on an area of hardstanding. It is proposed to locate the 3No

	<p>temporary pre-fabricated teaching pods in the north eastern portion of the site currently on a grassed area. A total of 375sqm of existing hard standing is designated for the temporary car parking spaces. New boundary treatment of 2.2m high plastic coated paladin fencing is proposed to enclose the car parking area; a pedestrian accessed ramp is proposed to allow access from car park to school buildings.</p>
9.3	<p>The SPPS sets out five core planning principles of the planning system, including improving health and wellbeing, creating and enhancing shared space, and supporting good design and place making.</p> <p><u>Impact on the setting of the Listed Building</u></p>
9.4	<p>It is generally accepted that modular buildings, especially within the setting of a listed building are not an ideal design solution given the site's existing character. Policy BH 11 of PPS 6 states that development will not normally be permitted which would adversely affect the setting of a listed building. Three key criteria must be met for development to be considered acceptable. The detail design respects the listed building in terms of scale, massing etc.; the works make use of traditional or sympathetic materials that respect the listed building and the nature of the proposed use respects the character of the setting of the listed building.</p>
9.5	<p>It is considered that the proposed modular buildings will have a sympathetic scale and massing to the listed building and the proposed use respects the character of the site, i.e. educational use. The proposed modular buildings do not make use of materials and techniques that respects the listed building and therefore fails to meet this criterion. However, Historic Environment Division is content with the proposal subject to removal of the temporary structures. A time limit condition will ensure the adverse impact upon the historic and architectural character of the listed school buildings, their curtilage and setting shall be of the minimum practicable duration.</p> <p><u>Loss of Open Space</u></p>
9.6	<p>The proposed modular buildings will result in a reduction of space within the school grounds but ample space will remain for normal school activities. The proposed kitchen/canteen will result in the loss of an area of hard-standing and the classrooms will be situated within a soft landscaped area. Policy OS 1 of PPS 8 advises that development that would result in the loss of existing open space should not be permitted, the site is located within an LLPA an area of protected open space in draft BMAP. The policy advises that an exemption will be permitted where it is clearly shown that there would be substantial community benefits. It is considered, in this case, that the temporary provision of school buildings is a significant community benefit and the development will be for a time limited period preventing the permanent loss of open space land within this LLPA. The site is zoned as whiteland within BUAP.</p>
9.7	<p>The use of modular buildings for temporary extra space within a school is an established practice within the city and further afield. The temporary use in this case, generated by a school merger programme, is considered acceptable.</p> <p><u>Impact on Character and Amenity</u></p>
9.8	<p>The buildings being located within the grounds of the school and the use for school activities ensures that there will be no negative impact on the character of the surrounding area which is made up of both residential and commercial units.</p> <p>Impact on the neighbouring amenity likewise will not be overly impacted upon, the modular</p>

9.9	<p>classrooms will be at the furthest point in site from the nearest neighbour residential dwelling. The kitchen building however, will be located next to a boundary with a residential dwelling. At this point the boundary is defined by a 2.0m high brick wall which separates the dwelling's driveway from the school. The living room window of this dwelling is at the furthest point from the boundary and the modular building is to be located to the east of the dwelling. Having taken all these points into consideration and, the temporary period the building will be on site it is considered that any impact will be at an acceptable level.</p> <p><u>Loss of Employment Land</u></p>
9.10	<p>PPS 4 requires at policy PED 7 that development that would result in the loss of land zoned for economic development to other uses. A section of the site is allocated for a new access and parking for the school which is zoned as an existing employment area in draft BMAP. The site is zoned as whiteland within BUAP. It is considered that the proposal will not result in the loss of any significant land zoned for employment (375 square metres in total). The section of site in question is a wedge of land between existing commercial buildings and a stream. Part of the site is already in use for car parking and the remainder vacant ground. The proposal will use this section of ground to provide an access and parking facilities for the school for a temporary period. For the above reasons it is considered that on balance the proposal will not result in the permanent loss of land zoned for existing economic development given the temporary nature of the proposal.</p> <p><u>Traffic Movement & Parking</u></p>
9.11	<p>The car parking spaces will be accessed from Grove Street East via the existing industrial yard. The proposal will provide 104 spaces five of which will be dedicated for disabled parking. Transport NI has verbally offered no objection to the proposal. However, final comments have not been received at the time of finalising this report. It is therefore proposed to put the final condition forward as a late item or to delegate the final wording of the conditions to the Director of Planning and Place post committee</p> <p><u>Other Environmental Matters</u></p>
9.12	<p>Environmental Services Department has verbally offered no objection to the proposal. However, final comments have not been received at the time of finalising this report. It is therefore proposed to put the final condition forward as a late item or to delegate the final wording of the conditions to the Director of Planning and Place post committee.</p>
10.0	Summary of Recommendation: Approval
10.1	<p>Having had regard to the statutory and draft development plan, relevant planning policies and other material considerations it is concluded that the proposal complies with the development plan, regional planning policy and other material considerations. It is recommended that the application is approved subject to conditions.</p>
11.0	Conditions
11.1	3 year time limit condition
11.2	Land restore back to former use following 3 year period
11.3	Boundary Fence and Gate Details

11.4	Final Transport NI Conditions to be added as per Paragraph 9.10
11.5	Final Environmental Health Conditions to be added as per Paragraph 9.11

ANNEX

Date Valid	11th November 2016
Date First Advertised	9th December 2016
Date Last Advertised	

Details of Neighbour Notification (all addresses)

1 Abetta Parade, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5EH,
1 Flora Street, Ballymacarret, Belfast, Down, BT5 4SN,
1,299 Beersbridge Road, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5DS,
10 Linen Gardens, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5LL,
10 Orby Chase, Ballyrushboy, Belfast, Down, BT5 5HF,
102 - 106 Grove Street East, Ballymacarret, Belfast, Down, BT5 5GH,
11 Abetta Parade, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5EH,
11 - 13 Linen Gardens, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5LL,
11 Orby Chase, Ballyrushboy, Belfast, Down, BT5 5HF,
12 Linen Gardens, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5LL,
12 Orby Chase, Ballyrushboy, Belfast, Down, BT5 5HF,
13 Abetta Parade, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5EH,
13 Linen Gardens, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5LL,
13 Orby Chase, Ballyrushboy, Belfast, Down, BT5 5HF,
14 Linen Gardens, Ballyrushboy, Belfast, Down, BT5 5LL,
15 Abetta Parade, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5EH,
15 Linen Gardens, Ballyrushboy, Belfast, Down, BT5 5LL,
16 Linen Gardens, Ballyrushboy, Belfast, Down, BT5 5LL,
17 Abetta Parade, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5EH,
17 Linen Gardens, Ballyrushboy, Belfast, Down, BT5 5LL,
18 Fashoda Street, Ballymacarret, Belfast, Down, BT5 5GW,
18 Linen Gardens, Ballyrushboy, Belfast, Down, BT5 5LL,
19 Abetta Parade, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5EH,
2 Elmgrove Road, Ballyhackamore, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5DJ,
2 Linen Gardens, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5LL,
2-12, Orby Link, Ballyrushboy, Belfast, Down, BT5 5HW,
20 Fashoda Street, Ballymacarret, Belfast, Down, BT5 5GW,
21 Abetta Parade, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5EH,
22 Fashoda Street, Ballymacarret, Belfast, Down, BT5 5GW,
23 – 27 Abetta Parade, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5EH,
270 – 287A Beersbridge Road, Ballymacarret, Belfast, Down, BT5 4RZ,
29 Abetta Parade, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5EH,
299 Beersbridge Road, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5DS,
3 Abetta Parade, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5EH,
3 Fashoda Street, Ballymacarret, Belfast, Down, BT5 5EX,
3 Linen Gardens, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5LL,
301 Beersbridge Road, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5DS,
31 - 45 Abetta Parade, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5EH,

<p>4 Elmgrove Road, Ballyhackamore, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5DJ, 4 Linen Gardens, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5LL, 44 Woodlee Street, Ballymacarret, Belfast, Down, BT5 5GN, 5 Abetta Parade, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5EH, 5 Fashoda Street, Ballymacarret, Belfast, Down,, 5 Linen Gardens, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5LL, 6 Elmgrove Road, Ballyhackamore, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5DJ, 6 Linen Gardens, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5LL, 7 Abetta Parade, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5EH, 7 Linen Gardens, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5LL, 8 Elmgrove Road, Ballyhackamore, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5DJ, 8 Linen Gardens, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5LL, 81 Woodcot Avenue, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5JB, 9 Abetta Parade, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5EH, 9 Linen Gardens, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5LL, 9 Orby Chase, Ballyrushboy, Belfast, Down, BT5 5HF, Apartment 1, 14 Orby Chase, Ballyrushboy, Belfast, Down, BT5 5HF, Apartment 2, 14 Orby Chase, Ballyrushboy, Belfast, Down, BT5 5HF, Apartment 3, 14 Orby Chase, Ballyrushboy, Belfast, Down, BT5 5HF, Elim Pentecostal Church, Abetta Parade, Ballyhackamore, Belfast, Down, BT5 5LA, Elmgrove Primary School, 289 Beersbridge Road, Ballymacarret, Belfast, Down, BT5 4RS, Nie, Grove Street East, Ballymacarret, Belfast, Down, BT5 5GH,</p>	
Date of Last Neighbour Notification	6th June 2017
Date of EIA Determination	N/A
ES Requested	N/A
Drawing Numbers and Title	
<p>01 – Site Location Plan 02A – Site Location Plan 03 – Temporary Dining Hall Plan, Sections, Elevations 04 – Temporary Classroom Unit 1 Prefab, Plans, Sections, Elevations 05 – Classroom Unit 2 & 3 Prefab, Plans, Sections, Elevations 06 – Decant Site Plan – Complete Site 07 – Boundary Fence and Gate Details 08 – Decant Site Ramp</p>	
Notification to Department (if relevant)	
<p>Date of Notification to Department: N/A Response of Department: N/A</p>	